

I C A N N
ANNUAL GENERAL

66

MONTRÉAL

2-7 November 2019



Third Accountability and Transparency Review Team (ATR3)

Update to the GAC @ ICANN66



November 2019

Overview of Presentation

1. Background on Accountability and Transparency Reviews (ATRTs)
2. Background on ATRT3
3. Sources of information for the topics to be assessed
4. ATRT2 recommendations and Implementation reports
5. ATRT3 survey
6. Accountability indicators
7. Prioritization

... continued on next slide

Overview of Presentation

8. Reviews

9. Diversity on the Board

10. Public consultations

11. Policy Development Processes (PDPs)

12. Summary

13. Public consultation on ATRT3 draft report

14. Questions

15. Conclusion

Background on Accountability and Transparency Reviews

New Operating Standards for Specific Reviews

- After a fulsome process new Operating Standards for Specific Reviews were introduced in June 2019 which were immediately applicable to any ongoing (at the choice of the RT) or future Specific Reviews.
- The most important changes made were with respect to the requirements for Specific Reviews making recommendations.

New Requirements for Recommendations

- Identification of Recommendation
- Definition of desired outcomes, including metrics used to measure whether the recommendation's goals are achieved
- Initial identification of potential problems in attaining the data or developing the metric
- Suggested timeframe in which the measures should be performed

New Requirements for Recommendations

- Definition of current baselines of the issue and initial benchmarks that define success or failure
- Data retained by ICANN
- Industry metric sources
- Community input
- Surveys or studies
- Consensus on Recommendation

ATRT2 Recommendations

- ATRT2 completed its work in December 2013 proposing 12 recommendations with 46 distinct components.
- The majority of recommendations focused on the Board and the GAC.
- Implementation of ATRT2 recommendations began in 2014 and was reported as completed in 2018.
- ATRT3 was mandated to review the implementation and effectiveness of these.

Background on ATRT3

ATRT3 Background

- ATRT3 held its first meeting on April 1st, 2019 and must complete its work by March 30th 2020 (originally scheduled to launch in January 2018 per the Bylaws but delayed due to the Transition).
- ATRT3 was originally composed of 18 members as follows:
 - 4 from ALAC
 - 1 from the ccNSO
 - 1 from the GAC
 - 7 from the GNSO
 - 1 from RSSAC
 - 3 from SSAC
 - 1 from the ICANN Board

ATRT3 Strategy on Recommendations vs Suggestions

- ATRT3 has opted to make both recommendations and suggestions (in some cases strong suggestions) in its final report due to the new requirements for recommendations.
- ATRT3 will limit making recommendations to topics which it believes are of critical importance.

ATRT2 Recommendations & Implementation

Summary of ATRT3 Assessment of ATRT2 Recommendations

- The ICANN.org implementation report of October 2018 noted that all ATRT2 recommendations had been implemented.
- ATRT3's assessment is:
 - 53% were completely implemented
 - 29% were partially implemented
 - 18% were not implemented

ATRT3 Survey

ATRT3 Survey: General Information

- ATRT3 conducted two surveys, one for individual respondents and one for Structures (SO/ACs, including GNSO constituent bodies and RALOs) from August 20th to September 23rd, 2019.
- The survey for Community Structures was essentially the same survey that was proposed to individuals but with the possibility to input text comments on a number of questions.
- 15 of 17 SOs, ACs, GNSO constituent bodies and RALOs responded to the Structures survey (2 GNSO constituent bodies did not respond).
- 88 individuals responded to the survey but only about 50 answered all the questions.

ATRT3 Survey: Summary of Responses

The strongest responses were in relation to the following topics for questions:

- Prioritization
- Specific and Organizational Reviews
- Diversity of Board members
- Public comment process
- Support for Board decisions

ATRT3 Survey: Main Issues of Interest for ATRT3

- Given the strong support for Board decisions it was not included as an issue for ATRT3 to consider.
- ATRT3 did add the issue of GNSO policy development based on its assessment of the ATRT2 recommendations and other input.
- The list of priority topics:
 - Prioritization
 - Specific and Organizational Reviews
 - Diversity of Board members
 - PDPs
 - Public comment process

ATRT3 DRAFT Suggestions relating to the GAC

ATRT3 Analysis of ATRT2 recommendations

- ATRT2 made 16 distinct recommendations relating to the GAC.
- ATRT3 assessed the implementation of these as:
 - 13 were completely implemented
 - 3 were partially implemented
 - None were not implemented

- ATRT3 Survey (great responses from GAC)
 - Should GAC accountability be improved? (73% structures responded Yes)
 - Should GAC transparency be improved? (54% structures responded Yes)
 - In your view are you satisfied with the interactions the GAC has with the Board? (64% structures responded Yes)
 - In your view are you satisfied with the interactions the GAC has with the SO/ACs ? (71% structures responded Yes)

ATRT3 DRAFT Suggestions relating to the GAC

- ATRT3 suggests that the GAC publish a short list of suggested qualities or requirements for liaisons to assist SO/ACs to select the best candidates to be GAC liaisons.
- ATRT3 suggests that the GAC in conjunction with ICANN should provide orientation for liaisons to GAC so they understand the environment of the GAC as well as the expectations for liaisons.
- ATRT3 suggests that the GAC continue to commit to its improvement efforts focusing on ensuring early engagement with relevant SOs and ACs on matters of importance to it.

ATRT3 DRAFT Suggestions relating to the GAC

- ATRT3 Strongly Suggests that the GAC develop and implement an accreditation process for GAC members which could privilege a “whole of government” approach.
- ATRT3 suggests that the GAC, in addition to suggestions 4.4.1.1 and 4.4.3.1, continue its continuous improvement efforts and focus on making the GAC communicate clearer to improve the community’s ability to integrate the GAC’s positions into their work.

ATRT3 DRAFT Suggestions relating to the GAC

- ATRT3 suggests that the GAC and the Board develop joint messaging about the current state of their interactions and the mechanisms which support these.
- ATRT3 suggests that the GAC, considering the success of the current mechanisms that are in place for interacting with the Board, work with the GNSO to implement similar mechanisms to facilitate interactions between the GAC and the GNSO.

Summary & Public Consultation on ATRT3 Draft Report

Public Consultation on ATRT3 Draft Report

- ATRT3 is currently planning to publish its draft report for public consultation by mid-December 2019 and closing at the end of January 2020.
- ATRT3 is also aware of the fact that there will be a number of other important public consultations that will be held in parallel (Auction Proceeds....).
- In order to help mitigate the workload on the community and in line with its suggestion for public consultations ATRT3 will also include in its public consultation on its draft report an augmented executive summary as well as a list of questions it would appreciate feedback on from the community.



Thank You and Questions

ATRT3 wiki: <https://community.icann.org/x/QK7DAw>

Email (publicly archived): input-to-atrt3@icann.org